Green Industrial Policy and Trade

A Tool-Box
The report is published as part of the Partnership for Action on Green Economy (PAGE) – an initiative by the United Nations Environment Programme (UN Environment), the International Labour Organization (ILO), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO) and the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR).

This publication may be reproduced in whole or in part and in any form for educational or non-profit purposes without special permission from the copyright holder, provided acknowledgement of the source is made. The PAGE Secretariat would appreciate receiving a copy of any publication that uses this publication as a source.

No use of this publication may be made for resale or for any other commercial purpose whatsoever without prior permission in writing from the PAGE Secretariat.

Citation
PAGE (2017), Green Industrial Policy and Trade: A Tool-Box

Disclaimer
This publication has been produced with the support of PAGE funding partners. The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of PAGE and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of any Government. The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the PAGE partners including concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The views expressed do not necessarily represent the decision or the stated policy of the PAGE partners, nor does citing of trade names or commercial processes constitute endorsement. Although great care has been taken to maintain the accuracy of information herein, neither UN Environment nor its Member States assume any responsibility for consequences which may arise from the use of the material.
Green Industrial Policy and Trade: A Tool-Box

The Environment and Trade Hub of UN Environment and UNIDO, under the Partnership for Action on Green Economy (PAGE), cooperate to undertake Green Economy Industry and Trade Assessments (GITA) in various PAGE partner countries, in collaboration with respective national partner institutes. To inform and guide the work of national partners, UN Environment and UNIDO have developed a tool-box discussing trade-related green industrial policies.

The Green Industrial Policy and Trade Tool-box serves as a ‘how to’ guide for national partners in considering different trade-related policy options to promote green industrial development. The tool-box provides a concise but encompassing overview of trade-related green industry policy tools and presents a methodology to assess the application of these tools. It is targeted primarily at national policy makers and green economy professionals that want to support green industrial development to transition to an inclusive green economy.

Acknowledgements

This publication was jointly developed by the Environment and Trade Hub (UN Environment) and the United Nations Industrial Development Organisation, under the Partnership for Action on Green Economy (PAGE).

The publication was authored by Jorge E. Viñuales (University of Cambridge), with support from Elena Antoni (UN Environment).

The overall process was managed by Elena Antoni (UN Environment) under the guidance of Anja von Moltke (UN Environment), and Konrad Ojeda (UNIDO) under the guidance of Claudia Linke Heep (UNIDO). The publication went through a number of review processes, including with PAGE partners, external experts, a review workshop held at The Graduate Institute, Geneva, on 28 August 2017, and a seminar at the International Labour Office, on 5 October 2017.

Contributions and suggestions from the following external and internal reviewers are gratefully acknowledged: Lorand Bartels, Verena Balse, Clara Brandi, Zoe Brennan, Elena Cima, Taylor Clayton, Liesbeth Casier, Neil Craik, Leslie-Anne Duvic-Paoli, Ilaria Espa, Markus Fischer, Florian Grisel, Moustapha Kamal Gueye, Steffen Kaeser, Ginevra Le Moli, Liang Guoyong, Tayutic Mena, Asad Naqvi, Maria Augusta Paim, Anna Pegels, Hector Pollitt, Anne Saah, Catherine Saget, Pablo Salas, James Salzman, Felipe Sandoval, Ronald Steenblik, Mahesh Sugathan, Junko Tayra, Vera Weick, Kerstin Wonka and Ying Zhang.

Thank you to Aiora Zabala for the layout design. All photos are under a Creative Commons license.

PAGE gratefully acknowledges the support of all its funding partners: European Union, Germany, Finland, Norway, Republic of Korea, Sweden, Switzerland and the United Arab Emirates.
Table of contents

Summary for policy makers ........................................................................................................... 7

Chapter 1: Green industrial policy and international trade .............................................................. 10
  1. Green industrial policy and trade ......................................................................................... 11
  2. The manual in the broader context of green industrial policy resources ............................... 17
  3. How to use this manual: Methodological framework ............................................................ 23
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 27

Chapter 2: Border measures ........................................................................................................... 29
  1. Overview ............................................................................................................................. 30
  2. The tool-box ....................................................................................................................... 33
  3. Case-studies ....................................................................................................................... 41
     Summary table ..................................................................................................................... 45
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 46

Chapter 3: Support schemes ......................................................................................................... 47
  1. Overview ............................................................................................................................. 48
  2. The tool-box ....................................................................................................................... 51
  3. Case-study: Supporting renewable energy in South Africa .................................................. 66
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 69

Chapter 4: Standards ................................................................................................................... 70
  1. Overview ............................................................................................................................. 71
  2. The tool-box ....................................................................................................................... 73
  3. Case-studies ....................................................................................................................... 86
     Summary table ..................................................................................................................... 89
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 90

Chapter 5: Sustainable public procurement and manufacturing .................................................. 91
  1. Overview ............................................................................................................................. 92
  2. The tool-box ....................................................................................................................... 95
  3. Case-studies ....................................................................................................................... 105
     Summary table ..................................................................................................................... 107
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 109

Chapter 6: Provisions in trade agreements reserving or promoting green industrial policy .......... 110
  1. Overview ............................................................................................................................. 111
  2. The tool-box ....................................................................................................................... 113
  3. Case-study: the integration of renewable energy in FTAs .................................................... 128
     Summary table ..................................................................................................................... 133
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 135

Chapter 7: Employment-related schemes ..................................................................................... 136
  1. Overview ............................................................................................................................. 137
  2. The tool-box ....................................................................................................................... 140
  3. Case-studies ....................................................................................................................... 147
     Summary table ..................................................................................................................... 150
     Resources ............................................................................................................................. 151

Detailed table of contents ............................................................................................................. 152
Figures

Chapter 1.................................................................................................................10
  Figure 1: Methodology to guide trade-related green industrial policy..................24
Chapter 5..................................................................................................................91
  Figure 1: Rationales and policy tools.....................................................................93
  Figure 2: UN Environment’s approach to sustainable public procurement............97
  Figure 3: Green manufacturing at different stages of the production cycle...........103
Chapter 6..................................................................................................................110
  Figure 1: Trends in the use of renewable energy provisions in FTAs (ordered
chronologically from 1992 (EEA) to 2016 (CETA))...........................................128
  Figure 2: Renewable energy provisions in FTAs...............................................129
  Figure 3: Renewable energy provisions in US FTAs............................................130
Chapter 7..................................................................................................................136
  Figure 1: Green Jobs............................................................................................139

Tables

Chapter 2..................................................................................................................29
  Summary table.......................................................................................................45
Chapter 3..................................................................................................................47
  Table 1: Trade-relevant support schemes for green industries..............................50
  Table 2: Taxonomy of local content requirements................................................58
  Summary table.......................................................................................................68
Chapter 4..................................................................................................................70
  Table 1: Standards and their design options.......................................................73
  Summary table.......................................................................................................89
Chapter 5..................................................................................................................91
  Summary table.......................................................................................................107
Chapter 6..................................................................................................................110
  Summary table.......................................................................................................133
Chapter 7..................................................................................................................136
  Summary table.......................................................................................................150
## Boxes

**Chapter 2**

Box 1: Boosting green industries through border measures......................................................32  
Box 2: Fuel Ethanol Tariff...........................................................................................................35  
Box 3: The *China – Raw Materials and China – Rare Earths* rulings.........................................40

**Chapter 3**

Box 1: Fast-tracking green patent applications.........................................................................47  
Box 2: China’s Golden Sun Program..........................................................................................52  
Box 3: The experience of Germany and Brazil in developing a renewable energy industry..................................................................................................................................................................................53  
Box 4: The *Canada – Renewables and India – Solar Cells* rulings........................................61  
Box 5: The influence of EU organic requirements....................................................................63  
Box 6: Ecuador’s green exports strategy......................................................................................64

**Chapter 4**

Box 1: Boosting green industries through standards.................................................................70  
Box 2: ISO 14001 certification....................................................................................................72  
Box 3: Premium prices for Forest Stewardship Council-certified wood and products............75  
Box 4: Exports of Nepalese organic tea.......................................................................................76  
Box 5: Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED)...........................................79  
Box 6: Korea’s standards for solar panels...................................................................................81

**Chapter 5**

Box 1: Hong Kong’s procurement of LED traffic light retrofit..............................................91

**Chapter 6**

Box 1: The legal relevance of the WTO Agreement’s preamble..............................................98  
Box 2: Examples of provisions reserving environmental regulatory space............................100  
Box 3: GATT Article XX - General Exceptions.......................................................................106  
Box 4: Article II:2(a) of the GATT.............................................................................................108  
Box 5: Provisions in FTAs relating to trade in environmental goods and services................110  
Box 6: TPP provisions relating to support schemes................................................................112  
Box 7: Provisions specifically referring to standards.................................................................114  
Box 8: Examples of provisions reserving environmental regulatory space...........................116

**Chapter 7**

Box 1: Job impact of the transition to a green economy.........................................................118  
Box 2: Country assessments......................................................................................................120  
Box 3: Transitions in coal mining.............................................................................................122

**Chapter 8**

Box 1: The experience of China and Brazil in developing a renewable energy industry...........124  
Box 2: China’s Golden Sun Program........................................................................................126  
Box 3: The influence of EU organic requirements....................................................................128  
Box 4: Ecuador’s green exports strategy......................................................................................130

**Chapter 9**

Box 1: Hong Kong’s procurement of LED traffic light retrofit..............................................132  
Box 2: ISO 14001 certification....................................................................................................134  
Box 3: Premium prices for Forest Stewardship Council-certified wood and products............136  
Box 4: Exports of Nepalese organic tea.......................................................................................138  
Box 5: Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED)...........................................140  
Box 6: Korea’s standards for solar panels...................................................................................142

**Chapter 10**

Box 1: The legal relevance of the WTO Agreement’s preamble..............................................144  
Box 2: Examples of provisions reserving environmental regulatory space............................146  
Box 3: GATT Article XX - General Exceptions.......................................................................152  
Box 4: Article II:2(a) of the GATT.............................................................................................154  
Box 5: Provisions in FTAs relating to trade in environmental goods and services................156  
Box 6: TPP provisions relating to support schemes................................................................158  
Box 7: Provisions specifically referring to standards.................................................................160  
Box 8: Examples of provisions reserving environmental regulatory space...........................162

**Chapter 11**

Box 1: Job impact of the transition to a green economy.........................................................164  
Box 2: Country assessments......................................................................................................166  
Box 3: Transitions in coal mining.............................................................................................168
Summary for policy makers

The green industrial policy turn
Emerging global threats arising from ecological tipping points and inequitable distribution of resources call for a new economic model capable of delivering enhanced prosperity and growing social equity, within the contours of a finite and fragile planet. This requires a structural change towards an economy that is low carbon, efficient and clean in production but also inclusive in consumption and outcomes. Industrial policy refers to government actions to alter the structure of an economy, encouraging resources to move into sectors that are perceived as desirable for future development. As such, lessons from industrial policy in the past can provide important guidance for countries transitioning to an Inclusive Green Economy. A green industrial policy can therefore be defined as an industrial policy that is meant to trigger and facilitate structural changes as entailed, or required, both to respond to environmental conditions or situations, and to develop a green, circular economy. As such, green industrial policy can be an important instrument to facilitate structural change. This is the case particularly in situations where so-called ‘market failures’, or imperfect market conditions, prevent the structural changes required to shift to an Inclusive Green Economy.

Trade-related green industrial policy tools
This tool-box aims to guide policy makers in the use of green industrial policy instruments that can be employed to improve a country’s economic competitiveness while advancing environmental protection and social inclusiveness. In doing so, this tool-box focuses on a sub-set of green industrial policies, namely trade policies that can be harnessed to promote green industries and green industrial policies that are of particular relevance from an international trade perspective. This is important because, firstly, trade is a highly regulated area of international law and policy makers must ensure that their policy choices are aligned with their obligations in global, regional and bilateral frameworks.

Secondly, trade has increasingly been recognized by the international community as an important driving force for sustainable development. This tool-box therefore aims to provide policy makers with guidance on how to navigate the complex interface between trade and green industrial policy, while realizing the potential that trade has to offer for the global shift towards an Inclusive Green Economy.

How to use this tool-box
This tool-box is intended as a practical and policy-relevant manual, targeted at national policy makers concerned with industrial, trade or environmental policies, as well as negotiators of trade and investment agreements. It therefore aims to provide a ‘menu for choice’ of the trade-related green industrial policy tools available and clarify their structure and operation, while outlining their implications with regard to trade policy. In doing so, the tool-box refers to some of the most relevant examples, successful but also unsuccessful. It also points to more specific resources for those that want to explore a particular tool further.

This tool-box can be used in two main ways: firstly, it can be used as a stand-alone resource by decision-makers who want to consider a wide range of trade-related policy options to advance certain pre-set goals. Secondly, when a State is still in the process of exploring whether or not to implement a green industrial policy and no general or specific goals have been set, a broader strategic process is necessary. In this case, this tool-box can be used as a complement to UNIDO’s Practitioner’s Guide to Strategic Green Industrial Policy.

The policy tools discussed in this tool-box
Within the broad spectrum of green industrial policies, this tool-box focuses on trade-related policy options that are made up of two categories of policies: the first category includes typical trade policies, such as tariffs and other border measures or provisions in trade agreements. These can be
used to conduct green industrial policy or to secure policy space for domestic instruments that promote green industrial policy. The second category encompasses policy instruments, such as subsidies and other support schemes, standards and public procurement, which due to their influence on trade, are highly regulated in international trade law. This category also covers employment-related policies, because trade normally entails major structural adjustments which, together with the transitional dimension of the move to a green economy, call for adequate employment and social policies. These policy tools are presented in individual chapters. Each chapter discusses the policy rationales for using the tool, the main varieties of the tool and their implications, and some representative examples. A summary table places the tool within an overarching methodology to guide trade-related green industrial policy. Furthermore, each tool chapter is accompanied by a list of carefully selected resources to go further in the understanding and implementation of the tool.

Chapter 2 discusses a variety of border measures that can be used by either importing or exporting countries as a tool of green industrial policy. These include tariff adjustments, carbon equalization measures, trade remedies and export restrictions. Tariffs adjustments, for example, may take the form of tariff increases or coordinated tariff reductions. The manual outlines a country’s option to increase tariffs on certain goods, which may, in particular circumstances, help to shield infant green industries and realize a latent comparative advantage. However, the manual also draws attention to the complex considerations that should be taken into account by decision-makers before embarking on this policy approach: green goods are included in global value chains and even a small increase in tariffs might lead to large price increase for the final product. Furthermore, tariff increases by one State may lead to retaliatory measures by other States. The case study on the APEC experience of liberalizing trade in environmental goods illustrates how countries may agree on a coordinated tariff reduction policy that can promote economic competitiveness while advancing environmental protection. The case study further clarifies the operationalization of liberalizing environmental goods at international level and the different avenues chosen by States to implement this approach within their national tariff schedules.

Chapter 3 discusses a wide variety of support schemes, organised under two broad headings, so-called ‘soft’ and ‘hard’ green industrial policies. ‘Soft’ policies include investment in infrastructure, research and development, as well as the reduction or removal of distortive subsidies to brown economy sectors. The enactment of a conducive regulatory framework and innovation policies, such as green patent fast-tracking, are also vital to create an enabling environment. One form of specific, or ‘hard’ green industrial policies include various forms of targeted financial subsidies. The chapter focuses on two tools that are more specifically related to trade, namely the use of local content requirements and export-related support. The chapter surveys their wide use in practice and alerts policy makers to the diverging views that exist on the use of these policy tools. The chapter closes with a case study on the experience of South Africa that switched from a feed-in-tariff to a competitive bidding system for renewable energy generation. The case study illustrates the South African experience of promoting renewable energy capacity while, at the same time, advancing economic development through a criteria-based bidding system linked to local content requirements.

Chapter 4 discusses standards which are broadly understood in this manual to include technical regulations, voluntary standards and conformity assessment procedures. The chapter illustrates how standards can, among others, help to promote exports by making visible the social and environmental benefits of their production vis-à-vis conventional products. From the perspective of importing countries, they can be an important tool to assure that imported products adhere to the same environmental and social standards as domestic products. Furthermore, standards can be part of a coordinated green industrial policy by reflecting the negative externalities of brown sectors and therefore help promote green products. The manual particularly highlights the importance of using international standards, as
this will be a consideration in determining the conformity of this policy tool with a country’s trade law obligations. One of the case studies of the chapter illustrates three landmark cases of the WTO Appellate Body to provide an insight into the complex legal considerations that decision-makers have to take into account when adopting standards.

Chapter 5 exemplifies the potential leverage of sustainable public procurement as an industrial policy tool: Making up 30 per cent of total GDP in developing countries, public procurement can provide a powerful tool to boost green industrial capacity. Furthermore, its strategic importance has been highlighted in numerous policy frameworks and significant space is provided for sustainable public procurement considerations in a variety of legal frameworks, including the GATT. In a second part, chapter 5 reviews green manufacturing processes and stresses the importance of green manufacturing in making products more competitive by reducing costs while improving environmental performance. The case study on green public procurement in the EU highlights the importance of two main elements: firstly, obligatory green procurement standards, and, secondly, country-level action plans and strategies, which is complemented by knowledge exchange across local or regional networks. A second case study reviews the experience of China’s efforts to make its economy more circular and resource-efficient, particularly by investing in integrated eco-manufacturing parks.

Chapter 6 discusses provisions in trade agreements promoting or reserving policy space for green industrial policy. Policy makers should carefully consider the level of protection and legal implications of different types of provisions: preambular references in trade agreements have, for example, often been misunderstood and may actually provide a powerful tool while being more easily obtainable in a negotiation context than other types of provisions. Policy makers should furthermore pay attention to the legal differences between reservations for environmental policy space, so called ‘carve outs’, and exceptions, with the former being preferable in terms of level of protection to the latter. In a second part, the chapter discusses provisions relevant to particular types of green industrial policy tools. The chapter closes with a survey of the treaty practice of the EU and the US. Free trade agreements, or FTAs, increasingly refer to general environmental, as well as specific renewable-energy provisions. Of note is particularly that provisions seem to be moving from a situation in which green industrial policies promoting renewable energy are admitted, to one in which they are actively encouraged.

Chapter 7 discusses employment-related schemes, which are of critical importance in order to ensure that the transition is sensitive not only to prosperity and environmental protection but also to considerations of inclusiveness. This is the case as, firstly, green industrial policy requires the availability of an appropriately trained workforce to avoid mismatches between industry support policies and the availability of skilled workers. Secondly, employment-related schemes are important from the perspective of structural adjustment that may arise from both trade opening and the transition to an Inclusive Green Economy. In order to respond to these needs and challenges, various types of policy measures may be applied: information gathering and assessment, social dialogue, participation and coordination measures, social protection measures and, last but not least, education and training. A case study on the ILO Green Jobs Assessments methodology illustrates the relevance of information gathering and assessment, with employment effects of a policy often being one, if not the main, decisive argument for or against its adoption. Policy makers should furthermore consider what methods may be appropriate to estimate jobs, taking into account resource and data availability and what shall be measured, such as ‘net’ employment creation through green growth or ‘gross’ employment effects, which take into account new green jobs created and those potentially lost in brown sectors.